

Package ‘mgsa’

November 28, 2024

Version 1.55.0

Date 2021-05-16

Title Model-based gene set analysis

Author Sebastian Bauer <mail@sebastianbauer.info>, Julien Gagneur
<gagneur@genzentrum.lmu.de>

Maintainer Sebastian Bauer <mail@sebastianbauer.info>

Depends R (>= 2.14.0), methods, gplots

Imports graphics, stats, utils

Suggests DBI, RSQLite, GO.db, testthat

Description Model-based Gene Set Analysis (MGSA) is a Bayesian modeling approach for gene set enrichment. The package mgsa implements MGSA and tools to use MGSA together with the Gene Ontology.

License Artistic-2.0

URL <https://github.com/sba1/mgsa-bioc>

biocViews Pathways, GO, GeneSetEnrichment

LazyLoad yes

Collate 'dottedTable.R' 'MgsaSets-class.R' 'MgsaGoSets-class.R'
'MgsaResults-class.R' 'mgsa-methods.R' 'mgsa-package.R' 'zzz.R'

git_url <https://git.bioconductor.org/packages/mgsa>

git_branch devel

git_last_commit d873604

git_last_commit_date 2024-10-29

Repository Bioconductor 3.21

Date/Publication 2024-11-27

Contents

mgsa-package	2
alphaMcmcPost	3
alphaPost	3
betaMcmcPost	4
betaPost	4
createMgsaGoSets	5
example-go	5
example-o	5
itemAnnotations	6
itemIndices	6
length,MgsaSets-method	7
mgsa	7
MgsaGoSets-class	10
MgsaMcmcResults-class	10
MgsaResults-class	11
MgsaSets-class	11
nsamples	12
plot,MgsaResults-method	13
pMcmcPost	13
populationSize	14
pPost	14
readGAF	15
restarts	16
setAnnotations	16
setsMcmcPost	17
setsResults	17
show,MgsaResults-method	18
show,MgsaSets-method	18
steps	19
studySetSizeInPopulation	19
subMgsaSets	20
Index	21

 mgsa-package

Model-based gene set analysis

Description

Model-based Gene Set Analysis (MGSA) is a Bayesian modeling approach for gene set enrichment. The package mgsa implements MGSA and tools to use MGSA together with the Gene Ontology.

Author(s)

Sebastian Bauer <Sebastian.Bauer@charite.de>, Julien Gagneur <julien.gagneur@embl.de>

References

S. Bauer, J. Gagneur and P. N. Robinson. GOing Bayesian: model-based gene set analysis of genome-scale data. Nucleic acids research, 2010.

alphaMcmcPost	<i>posterior estimates of the parameter alpha for each MCMC run</i>
---------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------

Description

Posterior estimates of the parameter alpha for each MCMC run.

Usage

```
alphaMcmcPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
alphaMcmcPost(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaMcmcResults](#).

Value

matrix: Posterior estimates of the parameter alpha for each MCMC run.

alphaPost	<i>Posterior for alpha</i>
-----------	----------------------------

Description

Realization values, posterior estimate and standard error for the parameter alpha.

Usage

```
alphaPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
alphaPost(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaResults](#).

Value

data.frame: realization values, posterior estimate and standard error for the parameter alpha.

betaMcmcPost	<i>posterior estimates of the parameter beta for each MCMC run</i>
--------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------

Description

Posterior estimates of the parameter beta for each MCMC run.

Usage

```
betaMcmcPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
betaMcmcPost(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaMcmcResults](#).

Value

matrix: Posterior estimates of the parameter beta for each MCMC run.

betaPost	<i>Posterior for beta</i>
----------	---------------------------

Description

Realization values, posterior estimate and standard error for the parameter beta.

Usage

```
betaPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
betaPost(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaResults](#).

Value

data.frame: realization values, posterior estimate and standard error for the parameter beta.

createMgsaGoSets	<i>This functions takes a 1:1 mapping of go.ids to items and returns a full MgsaGOSets instance. The structure of GO is gathered from GO.db. It is sufficient to specify just the directly asserted mapping (or annotation), i.e., the most specific ones. The true path rule is taken account, that is, if an item is annotated to a term then it will be also annotated to more general terms (some people prefer to say that just the transitive closure is calculated).</i>
------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Description

This functions takes a 1:1 mapping of go.ids to items and returns a full MgsaGOSets instance. The structure of GO is gathered from GO.db. It is sufficient to specify just the directly asserted mapping (or annotation), i.e., the most specific ones. The true path rule is taken account, that is, if an item is annotated to a term then it will be also annotated to more general terms (some people prefer to say that just the transitive closure is calculated).

Usage

```
createMgsaGoSets(go.ids, items)
```

Arguments

go.ids	a character vector of GO ids (GO:00001234)
items	a vector of identifiers that are annotated to the term in the corresponding position of the go.ids vector.

example-go	<i>Example GO sets for mgsa</i>
------------	---------------------------------

Description

This data is an example GO set for mgsa.

example-o	<i>Example objects for mgsa</i>
-----------	---------------------------------

Description

This data is an example objects for mgsa.

itemAnnotations	<i>Item annotations of a MgsaSets</i>
-----------------	---------------------------------------

Description

Item annotations of a [MgsaSets](#).

Usage

```
itemAnnotations(sets, items)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,missing'
itemAnnotations(sets, items)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,character'
itemAnnotations(sets, items)
```

Arguments

sets	an instance of class MgsaSets .
items	character an optional vector specifying the items of interest.

Value

a data.frame: the item annotations.

itemIndices	<i>Item indices of a MgsaSets</i>
-------------	-----------------------------------

Description

Returns the indices corresponding to the items

Usage

```
itemIndices(sets, items)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,character'
itemIndices(sets, items)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,numeric'
itemIndices(sets, items)
```

Arguments

sets an instance of class [MgsaSets](#).
items character or numeric the items of interest.

Value

a integer: the item indices.

length,MgsaSets-method
Length of a MgsaSets.

Description

Length (number of sets) of [MgsaSets](#).

Usage

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets'  
length(x)
```

Arguments

x an instance of class [MgsaSets](#).

Value

integer vector.

mgsa *Performs an MGSA analysis*

Description

Estimate marginal posterior of the MGSA problem with an MCMC sampling algorithm.

Usage

```

mgsa(o, sets, population = NULL, p = seq(min(0.1, 1/length(sets)), min(0.3,
  20/length(sets))), length.out = 10), ...)

## S4 method for signature 'integer,list'
mgsa(o, sets, population = NULL, p = seq(1, min(20,
  floor(length(sets)/3)), length.out = 10)/length(sets), ...)

## S4 method for signature 'numeric,list'
mgsa(o, sets, population = NULL, p = seq(1, min(20,
  floor(length(sets)/3)), length.out = 10)/length(sets), ...)

## S4 method for signature 'character,list'
mgsa(o, sets, population = NULL, p = seq(1,
  min(20, floor(length(sets)/3))), length.out = 10)/length(sets), ...)

## S4 method for signature 'logical,list'
mgsa(o, sets, population = NULL, p = seq(min(0.1,
  1/length(sets)), min(0.3, 20/length(sets))), length.out = 10), ...)

## S4 method for signature 'character,MgsaSets'
mgsa(o, sets, population = NULL,
  p = seq(min(0.1, 1/length(sets)), min(0.3, 20/length(sets))), length.out =
  10), ...)

```

Arguments

<code>o</code>	The observations. It can be a numeric, integer, character or logical. See details.
<code>sets</code>	The sets. It can be an MgsaSets or a list. In this case, each list entry is a vector of type numeric, integer, character. See details.
<code>population</code>	The total population. Optional. A numeric, integer or character vector. Default to NULL. See details.
<code>p</code>	Grid of values for the parameter p. Values represent probabilities of term activity and therefore must be in [0,1].
<code>...</code>	Optional arguments that are passed to the methods. Supported parameters are <code>alpha</code> Grid of values for the parameter alpha. Values represent probabilities of false-positive events and hence must be in [0,1]. numeric. <code>beta</code> Grid of values for the parameter beta. Values represent probabilities of false-negative events and hence must be in [0,1]. numeric. <code>steps</code> The number of steps of each run of the MCMC sampler. integer of length 1. A recommended value is 1e6 or greater. <code>burnin</code> The number of burn-in MCMC steps, until sample collecting begins. integer of length 1. A recommended value is half of total MCMC steps. <code>thin</code> The sample collecting period. An integer of length 1. A recommended value is 100 to reduce autocorrelation of subsequently collected samples.

`flip.freq` The frequency of MCMC Gibbs step that randomly flips the state of a random set from active to inactive or vice versa. numeric from (0,1].

`restarts` The number of different runs of the MCMC sampler. integer of length 1. Must be greater or equal to 1. A recommended value is 5 or greater.

`threads` The number of threads that should be used for concurrent restarts. A value of 0 means to use all available cores. Default to 0.

Details

The function can handle items (such as genes) encoded as character or integer. For convenience numeric items can also be provided but these values should essentially be integers. The type of items in the observations `o`, the sets and in the optional population should be consistent. In the case of character items, `o` and population should be of type character and sets can either be an `MgsaSets` or a list of character vectors. In the case of integer items, `o` should be of type integer, numeric (but essentially with integer values), or logical and entries in sets as well as the population should be integer. When `o` is logical, it is first coerced to integer with a call on `which`. Observations outside the population are not taken into account. If population is NULL, it is defined as the union of all sets.

The default grid value for `p` is such that between 1 and 20 sets are active in expectation. The lower limit is constrained to be lower than 0.1 and the upper limit lower than 0.3 independently of the total number of sets to make sure that complex solutions are penalized. Marginal posteriors of activity of each set are estimated using an MCMC sampler as described in Bauer et al., 2010. Because convergence of an MCM sampler is difficult to assess, it is recommended to run it several times (using `restarts`). If variations between runs are too large (see `MgsaResults`), the number of steps (steps) of each MCMC run should be increased.

Value

An `MgsaMcmcResults` object.

References

Bauer S., Gagneur J. and Robinson P. GOing Bayesian: model-based gene set analysis of genome-scale data. *Nucleic Acids Research* (2010) <http://nar.oxfordjournals.org/content/38/11/3523.full>

See Also

`MgsaResults`, `MgsaMcmcResults`

Examples

```
## observing items A and B, with sets {A,B,C} and {B,C,D}
mgsa(c("A", "B"), list(set1 = LETTERS[1:3], set2 = LETTERS[2:4]))

## same case with integer representation of the items and logical observation
mgsa(c(TRUE,TRUE,FALSE,FALSE), list(set1 = 1:3, set2 = 2:4))

## a small example with gene ontology sets and plot
```

```

data(example)
fit = mgsa(example_o, example_go)
## Not run:
plot(fit)
## End(Not run)

```

MgsaGoSets-class *Gene Ontology annotations*

Description

This class represents gene ontology annotations.

Details

For now, it is identical to the parental class [MgsaSets](#).

See Also

[readGAF](#)

MgsaMcmcResults-class *Instances of this class are used to hold the additional information that was provided by running (possibly multiple times) an MCMC algorithm.*

Description

Instances of this class are used to hold the additional information that was provided by running (possibly multiple times) an MCMC algorithm.

Slots

nsamples how many samples collected per MCMC run
steps how many steps per MCMC run
restarts how many MCMC runs
alphaMcmcPost posterior estimates for each MCMC run of the parameter alpha
betaMcmcPost posterior estimates for each MCMC run of the parameter beta
pMcmcPost posterior estimates for each MCMC run of the parameter p
setsMcmcPost posterior estimates for each MCMC run of the sets marginal posterior probabilities
 The columns of the matrices **alphaMcmcPost**, **betaMcmcPost**, **pMcmcPost** and **setsMcmcPost** stores the posterior estimates for each individual MCMC run. The row order matches the one of the slot **alphaPost**, **betaPost**, **pPots**, and **setsResults** respectively.
 Accessor methods exist for each slot.

See Also[mgsa](#)

MgsaResults-class	<i>Results of an MGSA analysis</i>
-------------------	------------------------------------

Description

The results of an MGSA analysis.

Slots

populationSize The number of items in the population.

studySetSizeInPopulation The number of items both in the study set and in the population.

alphaPost with columns value, estimate and std.error.

betaPost with columns value, estimate and std.error.

pPost with columns value, estimate and std.error.

setsResults with columns inPopulation, inStudySet, estimate and std.error.

The columns of the slots alphaPost, betaPost, and pPost contains a realization value, its posterior estimate and standard error for the parameters alpha, beta and p respectively.

The columns of the slot setsResults contains the number of items of the set in the population, the number of items of the set in the study set, the estimate of its marginal posterior probability and its standard error. The [rownames](#) are the names of the sets if available.

Because an MgsaResults is the outcome of an MGSA analysis (see [mgsa](#)), accessors but no replacement methods exist for each slot.

See Also[mgsa](#)

MgsaSets-class	<i>Sets of items and their annotations</i>
----------------	--------------------------------------------

Description

This class describes sets, items and their annotations.

Details

Internally, the method [mgsa](#) indexes all elements of the sets before fitting the model. In case [mgsa](#) must be run on several observations with the same gene sets, computations can be speeded up by performing this indexing once for all. This can be achieved by building a [MgsaSets](#). In order to ensure consistency of the indexing, no replace method for any slot is provided. Accessors are available.

The data frames setAnnotations and itemAnnotations allow to store annotations. No constraint is imposed on the number and names of their columns.

Slots

sets A list whose elements are vector of item indices.
 itemName2ItemIndex The mapping of item names to index.
 numberOfItems How many items?
 setAnnotations Annotations of the sets. The [rownames](#) are set names.
 itemAnnotations Annotations of the items. The [rownames](#) are item names.

See Also

[MgsaGoSets](#), [readGAF](#), [mgsa](#)

Examples

```
new("MgsaSets", sets=list(set1=c("a", "b"), set2=c("b", "c")))
```

nsamples	<i>How many samples per MCMC run collected</i>
----------	------------------------------------------------

Description

how many samples collected per MCMC run.

Usage

```
nsamples(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
nsamples(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaMcmcResults](#).

Value

integer: how many samples per MCMC run collected.

 plot,MgsaResults-method

Plot method for MgsaResults objects

Description

Plot method for MgsaResults objects

Usage

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
plot(x, y, ...)
```

Arguments

x	a MgsaResults
y	unused
...	unused

 pMcmcPost

posterior estimates of the parameter p for each MCMC run

Description

Posterior estimates of the parameter p for each MCMC run.

Usage

```
pMcmcPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
pMcmcPost(x)
```

Arguments

x	a MgsaMcmcResults .
---	-------------------------------------

Value

matrix: Posterior estimates of the parameter p for each MCMC run.

populationSize	<i>Size of the population of a MgsaResults</i>
----------------	------------------------------------------------

Description

The size of the population on which the analysis was run.

Usage

```
populationSize(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
populationSize(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaResults](#).

Value

integer: the size of the population.

pPost	<i>Posterior for beta</i>
-------	---------------------------

Description

Realization values, posterior estimate and standard error for the parameter p.

Usage

```
pPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
pPost(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaResults](#).

Value

data.frame: realization values, posterior estimate and standard error for the parameter p.

readGAF	<i>Read a Gene Ontology annotation file</i>
---------	---------------------------------------------

Description

Creates a `MgsaGoSets` using gene ontology annotations provided by a file in GAF 1.0 or 2.0 format.

Usage

```
readGAF(filename, evidence=NULL, aspect=c("P", "F", "C"))
```

Arguments

filename	The name of the Gene Ontology annotation file. It must be in the GAF 1.0 or 2.0 format. It may be gzip-compressed.
evidence	character or NULL. Only annotations with evidence code in evidence are returned. If NULL (default), annotations of all evidence codes are returned.
aspect	character with values in P, C or F. Only annotations of the listed GO namespaces P (biological process), F (molecular function) or C (cellular component) are returned. By default, annotations of the three namespaces are returned.

Details

The function extracts from the annotation file all direct gene annotations and infers from the Gene Ontology all the indirect annotations (due to term relationships). This is done using the package `Go.db` which provides the ontology as a database and `RSQLite` for querying the database.

Value

An `MgsaGoSets` object.

References

The Gene Ontology Consortium. Gene Ontology: tool for the unification of biology. *Nature Genetics*, 2000. The GAF file format: <http://www.geneontology.org/GO.format.annotation.shtml> GO evidence codes: <http://www.geneontology.org/GO.evidence.shtml>

See Also

[MgsaGoSets](#), [mgsa](#)

Examples

```
## parsing provided example file (yeast)
gofile = system.file("example_files/gene_association_head.sgd", package="mgsa")
readGAF(gofile)
## only annotations inferred from experiment or a direct assay
readGAF(gofile, evidence=c("EXP", "IDA"))
```

restarts	<i>How many MCMC runs</i>
----------	---------------------------

Description

how many MCMC runs.

Usage

```
restarts(x)
```

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
restarts(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaMcmcResults](#).

Value

integer: how many MCMC runs.

setAnnotations	<i>Set annotations of a MgsaSets</i>
----------------	--------------------------------------

Description

Set annotations of a [MgsaSets](#).

Usage

```
setAnnotations(sets, names)
```

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,missing'
setAnnotations(sets, names)
```

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,character'
setAnnotations(sets, names)
```

Arguments

sets an instance of class [MgsaSets](#).
names character an optional vector specifying the names of interest.

Value

a `data.frame`: the set annotations.

setsMcmcPost	<i>posterior estimates of the the set marginal probabilities for each MCMC run</i>
--------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Description

Posterior estimates of the set marginal probabilities for each MCMC run.

Usage

```
setsMcmcPost(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
setsMcmcPost(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaMcmcResults](#).

Value

matrix: Posterior estimates of the set marginal probabilities for each MCMC run.

setsResults	<i>Posterior for each set</i>
-------------	-------------------------------

Description

Number of items of the set in the population, the number of items of the set in the study set, the estimate of its marginal posterior probability and its standard error.

Usage

```
setsResults(x)

## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
setsResults(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaResults](#).

Value

data.frame: For each set, number of items of the set in the population, number of items of the set in the study set, estimate of its marginal posterior probability and standard error.

show,MgsaResults-method

Show an MgsaResults

Description

Show an [MgsaResults](#).

Usage

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'  
show(object)
```

Arguments

object an instance of class [MgsaResults](#).

Value

an invisible NULL

show,MgsaSets-method *Show an MgsaSets*

Description

Show an [MgsaSets](#).

Usage

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets'  
show(object)
```

Arguments

object an instance of class [MgsaSets](#).

Value

an invisible NULL

steps	<i>How many steps per MCMC run</i>
-------	------------------------------------

Description

how many steps per MCMC run.

Usage

```
steps(x)
```

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaMcmcResults'
steps(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaMcmcResults](#).

Value

integer: how many steps per MCMC run.

studySetSizeInPopulation	<i>Size of the study set of a MgsaResults</i>
--------------------------	-----------------------------------------------

Description

The size of the study set on which the analysis was run.

Usage

```
studySetSizeInPopulation(x)
```

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaResults'
studySetSizeInPopulation(x)
```

Arguments

x a [MgsaResults](#).

Value

integer: the size of the study set.

`subMgsaSets`*Subset of an MgsaSets*

Description

Returns a subset of an [MgsaSets](#) that contains only the specified items. Empty sets are removed.

Usage

```
subMgsaSets(sets, items)
```

```
## S4 method for signature 'MgsaSets,character'  
subMgsaSets(sets, items)
```

Arguments

`sets` an [MgsaSets](#).
`items` character. The items to restrict on.

Value

an [MgsaSets](#).

Index

- * **data**
 - example-go, [5](#)
 - example-o, [5](#)
- * **package**
 - mgsa-package, [2](#)
- alphaMcmcPost, [3](#)
- alphaMcmcPost, MgsaMcmcResults-method (alphaMcmcPost), [3](#)
- alphaPost, [3](#)
- alphaPost, MgsaResults-method (alphaPost), [3](#)
- betaMcmcPost, [4](#)
- betaMcmcPost, MgsaMcmcResults-method (betaMcmcPost), [4](#)
- betaPost, [4](#)
- betaPost, MgsaResults-method (betaPost), [4](#)
- createMgsaGoSets, [5](#)
- example-go, [5](#)
- example-o, [5](#)
- example_go (example-go), [5](#)
- example_o (example-o), [5](#)
- itemAnnotations, [6](#)
- itemAnnotations, MgsaSets, character-method (itemAnnotations), [6](#)
- itemAnnotations, MgsaSets, missing-method (itemAnnotations), [6](#)
- itemIndices, [6](#)
- itemIndices, MgsaSets, character-method (itemIndices), [6](#)
- itemIndices, MgsaSets, numeric-method (itemIndices), [6](#)
- length, MgsaSets-method, [7](#)
- mgsa, [7](#), [11](#), [12](#), [15](#)
 - mgsa, character, list-method (mgsa), [7](#)
 - mgsa, character, MgsaSets-method (mgsa), [7](#)
 - mgsa, integer, list-method (mgsa), [7](#)
 - mgsa, logical, list-method (mgsa), [7](#)
 - mgsa, numeric, list-method (mgsa), [7](#)
 - mgsa-package, [2](#)
 - MgsaGoSets, [12](#), [15](#)
 - MgsaGoSets-class, [10](#)
 - MgsaMcmcResults, [3](#), [4](#), [9](#), [12](#), [13](#), [16](#), [17](#), [19](#)
 - MgsaMcmcResults-class, [10](#)
 - MgsaResults, [3](#), [4](#), [9](#), [13](#), [14](#), [17–19](#)
 - MgsaResults-class, [11](#)
 - MgsaSets, [6–11](#), [16](#), [18](#), [20](#)
 - MgsaSets-class, [11](#)
- nsamples, [12](#)
- nsamples, MgsaMcmcResults-method (nsamples), [12](#)
- plot, MgsaResults-method, [13](#)
- pMcmcPost, [13](#)
- pMcmcPost, MgsaMcmcResults-method (pMcmcPost), [13](#)
- populationSize, [14](#)
- populationSize, MgsaResults-method (populationSize), [14](#)
- pPost, [14](#)
- pPost, MgsaResults-method (pPost), [14](#)
- readGAF, [10](#), [12](#), [15](#)
- restarts, [16](#)
- restarts, MgsaMcmcResults-method (restarts), [16](#)
- rownames, [11](#), [12](#)
- setAnnotations, [16](#)
- setAnnotations, MgsaSets, character-method (setAnnotations), [16](#)
- setAnnotations, MgsaSets, missing-method (setAnnotations), [16](#)

setsMcmcPost, [17](#)
setsMcmcPost, MgsaMcmcResults-method
 ([setsMcmcPost](#)), [17](#)
setsResults, [17](#)
setsResults, MgsaResults-method
 ([setsResults](#)), [17](#)
show, MgsaResults-method, [18](#)
show, MgsaSets-method, [18](#)
steps, [19](#)
steps, MgsaMcmcResults-method ([steps](#)), [19](#)
studySetSizeInPopulation, [19](#)
studySetSizeInPopulation, MgsaResults-method
 ([studySetSizeInPopulation](#)), [19](#)
subMgsaSets, [20](#)
subMgsaSets, MgsaSets, character-method
 ([subMgsaSets](#)), [20](#)

which, [9](#)